

FACT FINDING AND ASSESSMENT REPORT

MUZAFFARNAGAR AND SHAMLI DISTRICTS, UTTAR PRADESH



by Aman Biradari
Partnered by Islamic Relief India

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
INTRODUCTION.....	4
BACKGROUND.....	5
HUMANITARIAN ASSESSMENT OF CAMPS.....	7
Government (In)Action.....	11
Response by Civil Society.....	12
REPARATION, REHABILITATION, JUSTICE AND RECONCILIATION.....	13
CONCLUSION.....	17
RECOMMENDATIONS.....	18
ANNEXURE I: Details of Camps Visited.....	22
ANNEXURE 2: Case Studies.....	31
ANNEXURE 3: Details of Children who have Died in Suneti Camp	36

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In late December, a team from Aman Biradari and Islamic Relief Worldwide visited eight camps of displaced persons in Muzaffarnagar and Shamli districts in the aftermath of communal violence between Jats and Muslims in early September. The main goal for this assessment was to understand the experiences and everyday conditions of the survivors of violence and those who have fled their villages in fear so as to map humanitarian needs. Related to this, was an attempt to understand the possibilities and challenges of long term justice and reconciliation. We spoke with women and men, children, youth, the elderly, and persons with disability.

The majority of camps visited were unofficial camps located near Muslim-majority host villages. People here have largely faced abject need and neglect with respect to accessing



basic necessities, and have done so during the harshest weather conditions including scorching heat, heavy monsoon rains and a harsh winter. The numbers of those who have died in these camps are comparable to official statistics of the government on the number killed during the riots, including mostly children as well as older women and men. Acute needs include access to better, weather-proof shelter and sufficient bedding and clothing;

healthcare, particularly for pregnant and lactating women, children, the elderly, the disabled; food security including proper nutrition and drinking water; sanitation needs; livelihood opportunities; education needs including remedial learning; financial security; and addressing needs of those who have suffered sexual violence.

The violence and its aftermath, and the continuing suffering of thousands of victims, is a deep scar on our common humanity. In the backdrop of glaring government inaction and measures taken by the government to compromise the very idea of rehabilitation of people, it must become more active in ensuring people their rights, and in alleviating human suffering during this crisis. Aside from concrete steps needed in relation to provisioning for basic services for all displaced persons, the government must also take swift action with respect to facilitating access to identification, creating opportunities for employment; ensuring far greater accountability of local public institutions such as the police and hospitals; ensuring timely arrests and adjudication of cases, proper compensation for all who have suffered physical and/or mental trauma, and adequate legal aid for the same; ensuring an environment of security in the villages and surrounding areas and taking steps for rehabilitation and long term reconciliation. Wherever rehabilitation is not possible, government should aim at resettlement of people in a location of their choosing. Civil society groups must ensure that their interventions work toward the creation of an environment of peace and justice and that the needs of the most vulnerable in these camps are not overlooked.

INTRODUCTION

A team of 11 individuals¹ visited Muzaffarnagar and Shamli districts² of Uttar Pradesh from December 23-25. In the aftermath of communal riots between Jats and Muslims in early September (affecting people in five districts – Muzaffarnagar, Shamli, Baghpat, Meerut and Saharanpur), our objectives during the short time there were two-fold:

- 1) To assess the most immediate as well as longer term humanitarian needs, and
- 2) To attempt to understand the possibilities of long term reconciliation and justice.

Process

The team visited eight camps which had been functioning over the last four months, starting on or immediately after 08.09.13. The findings of the report are based on observation in the camps, interaction with survivors, camp organisers and staff of organisations providing assistance. There was an emphasis on speaking with survivors across demographic categories – adult women and men, children, youth, the elderly, and persons with disability, as also on looking at camp conditions from the perspective of most vulnerable persons in the camps. A few case studies in each camp were also documented (Annexure 2)³. The team's reach in accessing government records and figures was very limited during the two day visit. Thus, the lens for assessing the situation is largely from the perspective of those living in the camps.

Target Locations

The camps we visited in the two districts were situated in host villages, that is, villages, in this case Muslim-majority, which have welcomed and allowed the victims to settle there or set up camps. Some of these can also be characterised as unofficial camps, i.e. those established by riot-affected persons after the government closed the camps they were living in or those that have been informally established due to inability to reach government camps. There were differing notions about official camps, recognized by the government, where people are still living, as the government is not providing regular, comprehensive assistance in a single camp, but we did visit two such camps which are recognized by the local administration – Loi in Muzaffarnagar and Malakpur in Shamli – where the government has provided nominal assistance⁴. We did not visit any villages of returnees, i.e. new settlements or villages formed closer to where the victims were living earlier due perhaps, to persisting feelings of insecurity.

¹ The team included Agrima Bhasin, Amin Reza Khan, Anubhav Sapra, Asghar Sharif, Ashish Soni, Gitanjali Prasad, Javed Khan, Jeevika Shiv and Pooja Maggu from Aman Biradari (Delhi) and Sibghatullah Ahmed and Javed Hasan from Islamic Relief India.

² These two districts have the highest concentration of camps for displaced persons, followed by Ghaziabad.

³ Note: these are not for external circulation in their current form as all facts mentioned including names have not been changed.

⁴ This recently included 20 quintals of firewood sent to Malakpur, and food rations sent twice in four months to the two camps.

We visited three camps in Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district, and five camps in Kairana block, Shamli district. We did not visit camps in Shahpur block in Muzaffarnagar district or Kandhla block in Shamli district, the other two areas where this is a concentration of camps. Though estimates vary, there are currently approximately just over 20 locations where camps of varying sizes are located (Annexure 1). There are also camps in Ghaziabad district. Estimates of displaced vary, currently going up to over 50,000 people.

BACKGROUND

An incident in Kawal village in Jansath block of Muzaffarnagar district on 27.08.13, over 50 kilometres from where much of the rioting eventually took place is widely cited as the beginning of the tensions between the two communities. Based on the FIR, two bikes crashed and a fight ensued. Two boys – Sachin and his cousin Gaurav – killed a boy, Shahnawaz, with a gun shot. The two boys were lynched by a mob after this incident. Rumours (later found to be unfounded⁵) spread that Shahnawaz had teased and stalked the boys' sister, feeding into the prevalent campaign of "love jihad"⁶. This was followed by mobilisation of the Jat community in a number of panchayats and a "*Hindu Bachao, Beti-Biwi Bachao Sammelan*" mahapanchayat on 07.09.13. During the Jauli canal incident that followed when the Jats were returning, they were allegedly attacked by a Muslim mob that set fire to the tractors. The following day, riots began in villages in primarily Muzaffarnagar and Shamli districts, all of which had relatively small proportions of Muslims residing in them compared to the total population. Based on all we heard from volunteers, activists and survivors, it seems as though the trigger for these riots could have been any such event, be it Kawal, or any other incident that could be manipulated and used to polarise the people. The detrimental role of political parties in the lead up to the riots and in allowing them to take place cannot be underscored enough.

People in the camps comprise many who faced direct violence in their villages⁷ as also those who came away from their villages in fear that incidents might also take place there. Most fled directly to the camps in the aftermath of the violence, finding camps within a few kilometres of their home villages. Some of them were helped by people from other villages, such as Loi (proximate to Phugana, Lisarh, Lakh and others) to escape the violence on motorbikes and trucks. Others have travelled as far as 40-70 kilometres from their villages to other districts, in some cases stopping on the way at their relatives' to seek refuge and shelter⁸.

⁵ Article as accessed on 12.01.2014 <http://www.ndtv.com/article/india/the-mystery-of-kawwal-were-muzaffarnagar-riots-based-on-distortion-of-facts-418666>

⁶ Article as accessed on 12.01.2014 <http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/where-sangh-spins-narratives-of-victimhood-belligerence/article5113769.ece>

⁷ Based on conversations with survivors at Loi camp, these villages including the approximate number of people killed were as follows: Phugana (2), Kharad (2), Lakh (6-7), Lisarh (13), Bawadi (6-7), Hadoli (2), Simbhalka (1), Kakade (3-4), Kutba (8), Kutbi (7) and Mohammadpur-Rai Singh (2-3). In Hadoli and a few other villages, the mosque was also burned down. They cited two members of the Jat community as having been killed in Kakade.

⁸ While many have at this point located their families, the team met women such as Sana in Suneti (Pathed Road) camp, who said she has no idea where her mother, who lived in Phugana, might be. She says she has not

People recounted harrowing tales of having to hide in sugarcane fields and in many cases, wait to be rescued by others. A woman in Barnawi-II (North) camp in Shamli district, spoke of the horror of fleeing through fields in her home village of Hasanpur (Mijra) in Ligarh, only to realise at the end that her small infant who she was holding on to had fallen somewhere on the way (and has remained missing since).

In the past four months in these camps, displaced persons have endured many extreme weather conditions including harsh heat, heavy rain, and bitter cold while struggling to access the most basic rights and necessities for survival. Every camp and its arrangements are overseen by a camp committee, whose members are from the host village, very often including the village pradhan⁹. These camps are located adjacent to Muslim-majority villages. In reference to the camps we visited and based on the conversations we had with people assisting in relief work, the humanitarian situation in Shamli is relatively worse than in Muzaffarnagar, with external aid arriving in all the camps we visited in Shamli only after 22.11.2013. These discrepancies extended to access to all basic needs – rations, shelter, clothing, sanitation, and health.

A number of people in the camps recounted tales of terror from early September. Most said that they were completely taken off guard by the sudden turn of events and the nature of the targeted violence against them, speaking of good relations and in many cases deep friendships between members of the two communities for as long as they could remember. Others had different stories to share in the days leading up to the riot – those of incidents where their beards were pinched and they were told to shave their beards and not wear their skull caps, they were verbally abused, told not to walk through the Jat basti in the village, or simply, in some cases, ignored and not acknowledged. These experiences and opinions are closely connected to people's views on returning to their villages in the future, which will be discussed in a later section.

There was large-scale damage to homes, shops, livestock, and mosques in the villages where riots took place. In Hadoli village, Budhana block, the mosque that had been recently built was set on fire. Fans fixed along the walls were first looted, as were the utensils that were kept in the mosque for rental during weddings.

been able to get in touch as there is often not enough electricity to charge mobile phones and she keeps receiving a switched off message. She worries for her safety.

⁹ In most cases, these committees have updated notes on the numbers of births and deaths in the camps, lists of pregnant and lactating mothers, disabled children etc.

HUMANITARIAN ASSESSMENT OF CAMPS

In the aftermath of the death of 34 children in the camps due to cold and illness, and despite heightened media attention on the plight of displaced persons, directives by the Supreme Court to the UP government on the issue, and multiple fact-finding visits by NGOs and activists through the camps, the quality and quantity of relief being provided in the camps continued to be grossly insufficient at the time of our visit. For basic information about each camp and humanitarian assessment data on particular issues, please refer to Annexures 1.1 and 1.2, respectively. A summary of our findings on issues of both immediate and long-term concern are provided below.

Shelter and Clothing: In each camp we visited, the tents are far from weather-proof. Insulation varied based on the number of layers of material the families managed to collect for each tent. Around the time at which we visited, dew would start dripping off the inside of the tents as early as 10 pm, leaving the tents, blankets and areas where the water dripped wet for much of the following day. Greater resources for shelter are urgently required – both in the short and long-term. Even in camps like Loi which were relatively far

better resourced and where tents were larger in size due to availability of materials and space, there was great disparity of what was available to people within the camp. Some tents in Dabedi Khurd had only a single layer of blue tarpaulin. While Loi was relatively better off in terms of availability of materials for shelter, there was great disparity of what was available to people within the camp. In a few camps such as



Dabedi Khurd and Barnawi, people had begun to construct mud houses. Only the physically fit and able could do this, though, and while mud can be dug up from within the camp, accessing bricks and other materials is not easy and requires resources. When asked where they would like to be living long-term, most expressed the desire for the government to allow them to build houses for themselves at the camp sites, in order to live where they felt relatively safer.

While a number of clothes had been received in the bigger camps in Muzaffarnagar, in Shamli we met women who had been wearing the same piece of clothing since they arrived in the camps four months ago. In Barnawi-II (South), a number of young children simply had no warm clothes to cover themselves with and no shoes and socks to keep themselves warm.

Food Security: Particularly in the camps in Shamli, families are not able to eat more than one full meal a day, usually a combination of dal and rice or roti, or on occasion, tea and biscuits or rusk. Due to having their houses looted, they have little to no money or are

indebted and thus unable to purchase food from the market. A weak diet in the winter, is leading to a weak immunity and a diminished resistance against the cold.

Many pregnant and lactating mothers, children and the elderly, are suffering from a lack of nutritious food intake. In most camps, rations are distributed and noted in a small notebook, one for each family, with rations being distributed once in 10-15 days in the camps where there is regular delivery of rations. It is more erratic in camps that are relatively neglected or which have to depend entirely on food from outside the village they were living close to, such as in the case of Barnawi-II (South) and Suneti-I as well as Pathed road. There is a fair amount of variation across camps in terms of what families received.

Sanitation and Drinking water: Sanitation facilities seemed consistently poor across all camps and settlements. Cesspools are common, as water collects in uneven depressions in the ground. Due to the lack of toilets in the camps and paucity of space, it is not uncommon for sewage to be part of the pools of water. Handpumps, where they exist, are found close to these pools, as are *chulhas* meant for cooking. People said that the water from handpumps was largely salty and not fit for drinking.

Health: Perhaps the grossest neglect, connected closely with sanitation, nutrition and shelter is access to healthcare for people currently displaced. Common illnesses we heard of include pneumonia, diarrhoea, dengue, jaundice, and typhoid. There is an acute need of both medicines and doctors in most camps. Following the death of 35 children in the camps due to cold and insufficient medical care, broadcasted by many media channels, government health workers were sent by the administration a few days prior to our visit in some camps. In Loi, five doctors were found sitting idle and chatting in a circle for the majority of our time at the camp site. In the camps where they were present, they would come for between 1 and 4 hours, 1 hour being the most prevalent window. Prior to this, the displaced persons from Loi camp were accessing Unani (traditional medical treatment system) medicine from a doctor in the village, with no access to allopathic treatment. Even in the cases where the doctors are present, they sit in one place, expecting those who need treatment to come to them. For many who are bedridden or vulnerable in any other way, particularly the elderly, women and children, they are unable to go to the doctor. In Suneti-I camp, a woman who dislocated her shoulder while escaping her village is lying in a state of pain and suffering due to lack of care. Many also said they are given the same medicine across different ailments.

Women's Health: Pregnant and lactating women require rest, a healthy diet, good sanitary facilities, rest, a monthly check-up and access to a woman doctor in the camp – none of which they are able to get¹⁰. They often undertake laborious work, eat last, are compelled to live in unhygienic surroundings and have difficulty in visiting a private doctor due to financial constraints. The health of adolescent girls, single women, and elderly women suffering from illnesses, infections, and body ache may not be prioritised. In many cases, women privileging the needs of their family members over themselves, and having

¹⁰ Midwives from within the camp population itself have assisted in the delivery of children in Barnawi-II (South) and Saneti-I. They express that they need some basic clean equipment which could be provided to them through relief organizations.

reluctance to voice their health concerns due to prevailing hierarchies and stigmas means their needs are often side-lined.

Child Deaths: The potential causes of child deaths across relief camps are similar and may be listed as the lack of nutrition from milk or food (while powdered milk is available in places, buffalo milk more nutritious in its content is not), cold resulting in pneumonia and weakened physical state, absence of medicines, round-the-clock doctors and proper diagnosis of problems, snake and insect bites, poor hygiene and sanitation resulting in poor absorption of food and nutrients, inadequate bedding and warm spaces. A number of infants have also perished during this time. We met one mother of a five day old baby and another of an eight day old baby, both of whom had died in the camp, this despite the fact that they were both taken to the Kairana government hospital for treatment.

The apathy and discrimination shown by medical professionals in government institutions is appalling, as also their lack of capacity to be able to help in such a situation. A man in Joula camp had taken his still very ill wife to the government hospital in Budhana. They were laughed at and ridiculed and he was told by them that she had no fever at all even when she was burning up. In another instance, a woman we met in Jogia Khera had gone to the Muzaffarnagar government hospital for a medical exam as she had allegedly been raped. She was told by the doctor there that she was lying and that she was making up stories. While we were at Malakpur, a woman came with the complaint that her four year old was very ill. In the absence of a doctor in the camp, one of our teammates called the 108 number for an ambulance, he was told by the driver that he had already passed the camp and could not turn back. People said on other occasions that this is not uncommon. In one case, a man recounted calling the number and the driver responded saying he's not a garbage collector and could not come to their camp.

Education: A large number of riot-affected children and youth have been displaced and excluded from school or college education. Many of them studied in mixed groups with children of Jats as their closest friends. Their books, notes, exam hall tickets and bags have been left behind, probably even burnt. The children and youth we met at the camp miss going to school and college. A few camps have set up makeshift madrasas and modest primary teaching facilities, however, these are greatly inadequate and many other camps have no such facilities. Parents we spoke to said that they would prefer to send their children to schools with more comprehensive subjects being taught. Since the madrasas stop short of teaching a range of subjects except Urdu and in some cases, Hindi, a thoughtful approach to education, play activities and learning for children is required.

The children who are going to appear for their class 10 and 12 board examinations in a few months risk losing a year. They have had no access to schools or books and require teaching and tuitions on an urgent basis. They are uncertain about where their hall-tickets will come from. Who will give them their hall-tickets, will they have to travel to their own school which at times is near the place where violence happened or will they receive their hall tickets in camps, for which they might have to stay in camps, How and when will the process of identification of such children happen, are some of the questions that require an urgent resolution. The government has not bothered about the plight of these children and is yet to initiate any kind of effort to address the needs of such children.

Aamir, a 19 year old boy is disabled from his waist down. He was sent to his aunt and uncle's village in Baghpat as his parents could not look after him. He was in Class 6 during the time of the riots. He swings his legs seemingly effortlessly under him as he takes strides with his two palms on the ground. The camp conditions are extraordinarily difficult for him, but he doesn't complain. He simply says with a determined smile that he wants to be able to go back to school and complete his studies.

Livelihood Security: In the absence of a system in place where people are being given access to their rights to live a life of dignity, food security and other needs of a family, even in this post-riot situation is directly linked with the ability of family members to work and eke out a living¹¹. Displaced by the riots, survivors, especially men, were formerly engaged largely as daily wage labourers, as agricultural workers, washermen, brick kiln workers, *lohar* (ironsmith), *barhi* (carpenters), *darzi* (tailor), *pheri wale* (clothes and other hawkers/vendors), artisans, as mechanics, *mistry* (masons) etc¹². Women too were engaged as agricultural labourers or in home-based work. Some were working outside of UP when the riots took place and had come home for *Eid* during the month of *Ramzan*, but have remained to look after their families in the aftermath.

With their trust betrayed by perpetrators and in many cases their former employers in their home villages, and recent stories of economic and social boycott faced by some who have tried to return to their villages even in places where violence didn't take place, these men and women cannot hope to return to their old jobs. They also feel insecure in leaving their families at the camp to go out for work. Some in Dabedi Khurd said that they went to work as labour on sugarcane fields and brick kilns a month ago, but thought it to be futile as they weren't paid for their day's work and they could not say or do much as they are unfamiliar with the place. Some also said they also don't want to leave for work because they need to be physically present in the camps to avail relief or compensation. There is a significant demand for employment – men want material or financial assistance to be able to start work again. Women unanimously said they would benefit from access to sewing machines. It is understood that the State government has announced a loan-based scheme for livelihoods and a Rani Lakshmi Bai pension scheme for aged women above 60 years of age. In Shahpur, according to a field volunteer, three boys, whose parents were killed in the riots, have been employed as peons or clerks by the state government.

Sexual Violence against Women: Most women, if not all, recall that their husbands, fathers, brothers were out at work when they ran out of their homes to save their lives from the approaching rioters. A large number of young girls, unmarried women, widows, and mothers, were brutally attacked and sexually assaulted by the rioters. Only in 21 cases have FIRs been filed. Women continue to suffer the consequences of the riot and the personal assault on their dignity, without any psychosocial care outside of their loved ones. No arrests have been made in any of these cases. The social stigma around rape makes it extraordinarily difficult for women to break their silence. It is believed that some of the FIRs filed have been deliberately recorded by the police in a way to make them weak so that

¹¹ As in the case of accessing health needs, here too, the elderly are sadly the last to be able to find means of employment and in many cases as seen in the camps are physically very badly affected.

¹² Almost all have lost their tools and equipment for their work.

they would not stand the court. Six survivors of sexual assault are learnt to have testified before the court in Delhi.

Child Marriages: Across the camps, child marriages have taken place in large numbers. In Malakpur on 25.10.13, 50 girls, many below the age of 18, were married in the presence of Maulana Mehmood Madni. In most cases, the girls have been married to families outside of the camp, while in certain cases they have married within the camps, and in still others, the married couple are now living and working at brick kilns. The events during the riot as well as the current camp environment are regarded by parents as unsafe and as a threat to the honour of young girls. In addition, unmarried, young girls are considered an economic burden on the family. It is for these reasons and in some cases, out of poverty and uncertainty about what lies ahead, where families are offered Rs. 2,100 by Jamiat-Ulema-i-Hind and some assistance with dowry to get their daughters married, that girls have been married. In some cases, these girls also face the risk of exploitation or an early pregnancy. One family in Dabedi Khurd talked of a girl who was married into a family in the village itself, only to later be mistreated and told that her family must give half the compensation amount that they received from the government. Many mothers we spoke with who would like to get their daughters married soon said that their daughters were in school when the displacement suddenly took place.

Financial security: Most displaced persons were working class people, daily wage earners who had very gradually accumulated assets, including their homes, over generations. Almost all had homestead land. They had worked extremely hard to build their lives, and are now at a loss as to how to feed and take care of their families. Many workers have lost their tools and equipment for their particular trade as well as livestock. In Dabedi Khurd, we met a few families who also had agricultural land, tractors and boring equipment, all of which has been looted or destroyed during the riot. Many people in the camps have taken loans from relatives and others in the host villages including moneylenders to try to make ends meet, and in some cases, to get resources such as bricks or mud in order to build small semi-pucca homes in the camps.

Government (In)Action

The numbers of those who have died due to illness and/or cold in these camps are comparable to the official death toll of the riots of 48 persons killed. As recently as early January, a seven year old boy and 48 year old man died in the Barnawi camps¹³.

Government support to the camps began a fortnight after the riots took place with sending food rations¹⁴ the first time the administration visited the few camps that they recognized – including Loi, Malakpur, Shahpur and Barnawi – which were not even a fourth of the total camps at the time. Rations arrived in these camps a total of four times in two months. By November, rations from the government had stopped. To a few of the more neglected camps in Shamli, the administration sent blankets, highly inadequate for the number of families there. In Dhabedi Khurd camp, 35 blankets were sent for a camp with 70 *families*.

¹³ Information c/o Astitva field officer

¹⁴ This included a one-time provisioning of 250 gm of milk

An elderly woman remarked: “I think they did it to create chaos amongst us. There were only 35 blankets for 300 people, which we were supposed to claim by providing our signature or giving our thumb print and having our photo taken. People were fighting one another for them, because no one had anything to keep themselves warm at night. We would like for there to be some dignity in how we are treated.” A man lamented that he had just gotten an election card after a long struggle of five years and that he would now have to go through the same process again. There has been a near absence of care and interest shown from the elected representatives as well, where in almost all cases, no MLA or MP from the area has come to the camps.

In Loi, which serves as an exception, the police came to the camps to help register cases, but everyone complains that there has been no assistance from them in terms of returning to the villages with protection in order to get their belongings or to document the damage that has taken place¹⁵. Worse still, the police and state machinery, in a few cases, have been aggressively hostile in evicting the survivors from the camps and demanding that they go elsewhere with 5 lakh as compensation. In this context, the role of the media, in pressuring the state and central government to proactively take action in favour of the survivors and against prejudiced officers, may be crucial. By the first few days of January, Loi has been completely raised, and people have been forced to find alternatives for their shelter.

Thus at the camps, there is a palpable sense of insecurity, both with respect to the uncertainty of whether or not people will be forced to move in the bitter cold, as well as with respect to physical security from the dominant community in the aftermath of the riot. Women in the camps are not able to move out of the camps at all due to concerns about their safety. Men say that incidents of teasing and harassment have continued after the riots, and they worry that if the women leave the premises to take a bus for instance, they may not come back.

The absence of the government from providing relief in the aftermath of a riot which they did not do enough to prevent or control sooner runs counter to the core responsibilities of a democratically elected government. Additionally, by not acknowledging the existence of most camps, they are ignoring the suffering of thousands of people.

Response by Civil Society

Astitva¹⁶, Oxfam, Action Aid and Vanangana currently are working in coordination with one another and providing blankets, bedding, hygiene kits, and rations largely in some of the more neglected camps in Shamli district apart from the Camps in Muzaffarnagar district. Organizations and collectives such as the Human Rights Law Network, ANHAD and All India Democratic Women’s Association are providing legal aid, material support and coordinating aspects of the humanitarian assistance.

¹⁵ This was found to be the case in all but one case of Loi camp where survivors returned with the police to document the destruction of the mosque and shops.

¹⁶ An NGO working in UP since 2006, largely on Right to Education and child rights, as well as caste-based atrocities

The Youth Congress claims to be helping out at Loi and assisting in five camps in Shamli district – Malakpur, Dabedi Khurd, Suneti, Masoora and Ambela, providing blankets, food rations, tarpaulin and medicine. But these seemed to be empty claims, as we did not find a single doctor at any of their medical camp tents when we visited.

In the absence of any well-planned, sustained and adequate government relief or sufficient relief from NGOs, religious charities have come in to fill the vacuum and are providing a range of necessities including providing medical assistance, blankets, clothing, money and rations. But these efforts too, are not enough to adequately provide for relief in these camps.

REPARATION, REHABILITATION, JUSTICE, AND RECONCILIATION

“Relief that is pouring in from various parts of the country is only temporary in nature, but the larger questions of tolerance and *insaniyat* (humanity) still remain to be addressed. We will accept no other form of justice but that,” said one man from the Barnawi camp as persons gathered around talking about the loss of citizenship and dignity and never wanting to return to a place where one has to live in fear day and night. “In the long run, money will come from somewhere and that isn’t a worry, what we need is *insaaf* (justice) and rights as equal citizens of this country. We have been suppressed for generations by the Jat community which has been using our landless status to exploit us further over the years and now they are getting away with a brutality never seen before.”

Willingness to Return

The events that unfolded during the riots are very much alive in the minds of displaced persons. This no doubt affects their current opinions on the possibility of return to their villages and long-term reconciliation between the two communities. Every single person interviewed said that whether they get compensation or not, they cannot go back to their villages after having survived what has happened. Many who came from villages out of fright and not due to actual rioting in their villages stated the same, saying that anything can happen now and they are frightened to return. The social fabric, in particular in areas where violence has taken place, appears at this moment to be broken.

In Jogiya Khera, some young men said: “If they’ve burned our mosques, how can we go back? They’ve killed our elders, burnt our homes.” One man from Phugana says that Jats are still saying that if Muslims go back, there will be atrocities: “*Phugana ka Musalman vapis aayega toh atyachaar hoga*. (If Muslims of Phugana come back, there will be violence.)” A few people responded to all this saying: “Why should we fear? We have nothing left.” A number of people in different camps responded to us saying, “We will live on the road or rather die in this camp, but will not return”.

Survivors also recounted several cases of sexual violence and assault against women. Parents often evade or falsely reassure in response to children’s innocent questions about returning to home villages. ‘*Hum unhe jhoothi tassali dete hain* (We give them false hope),’

confesses a father. Some families in Kharod village were unwilling to return due to the large-scale violence there and those who had land have sold it at throwaway prices.

Some have taken place, as recounted by those in camps, where people have made attempts to return but have faced hostility. A woman in Barnawi camp mentioned that she along with her husband tried going back to pick some household items, and while she was returning from the village, men from the Jat community threatened to kill her and they fled from there. In a big set back to the rehabilitation process, three youth from the Muslim community were killed in Mohammadpur-Rai Singh village in late October.

There were, however, a handful of interactions that made us believe that reconciliation, while perhaps a distant reality, is not impossible. In Loi, we were told that people returned to Karoda Mahajan village as there had been no violence there. Camp organisers also expressed that Jats from different villages, where riots didn't take place, came for the visit to express empathy and compassion towards the situation. In response, they were welcomed, and there was no tension



between the members of the two communities. They said, *“unhone koi jhagre ki baat nahi ki, to humne bhi kuch nahi kiya* (They didn't fight, so neither did we do anything)”. In another case, Jats from one village came to speak to the four Lohar families that had left their village, and asked them to return, however in this case, it seemed to be a straightforward case of requiring their skills. One woman said that there were a few Jats in their village who tried to help. Our local taxi driver from Baghpat district says that his Jat friends in his village called him and informed him to take his family and leave as they had a sense that violence may take place. It did not, and he and his family have returned to their village.

Compensation: Idea of Rehabilitation Compromised by Government

While imperative to respect the lived reality and opinions of those who have faced violence or for whom self-preservation and protection is an utmost need, the government has the vital responsibility of not being communal in its dealings with the affected people.

In the compensation process, the idea of rehabilitation of displaced persons has been entirely compromised. In the aftermath of the riot, the state government announced varying compensation amounts – Rs. 5 lakhs for those who were seriously injured and Rs. 10 lakhs (plus 2 lakhs from the Centre) for those whose family members died in the riots. However, a poor decision with potentially lasting consequences was taken to offer survivors from nine affected villages, 5 lakhs in return for a signed affidavit surrendering their property in the home village and any intention to ever return, and ensuring that they do not ask for any further compensation regarding immovable property in the home village or elsewhere¹⁷. Anyone who claimed the compensation was forced to sign this document. This

¹⁷ Article as accessed on 10.01.2014 <http://caravandaily.com/portal/independent-probe-flays-up-govt-of-forced-demographic-change/>

is likely to change the demographics of entire villages, ensuring that those who receive compensation never return. While the prevailing sentiment amongst survivors is very much of fear and not being able to consider the thought of return and reconciliation at this stage, this move by the government ensures that it will never be a possibility for these communities to live together in their home villages again.

Furthermore, procedure for determining who is eligible for compensation is riddled with inconsistencies. Identification surveys in the home villages by district officials rely on the input of lekhpals in the village, who are in these cases most often Jats. Figures related to the exact number of individuals who have been given compensation are contested, but are known to be between a total of 801-817 in Muzaffarnagar and Shamli districts. While there are varying compensation amounts based on the ways in which people have been affected, people do not seem to be aware of this in the camps itself, and there is one dominant narrative of the 5 lakh compensation amount. Families are worried of being left out. In Jogia Khera, people from Lisarh village said that while the survey of their village had already been done by the local administration to ascertain who should receive compensation, their basti called Hasanpur (Majra) had been left out.

These compensation amounts also makes one wonder what options this system gives to a single mother for reparations if she has been raped and had her house looted, as was the case of a woman we spoke with in Jogia Khera who has filed an FIR.

Others said that 5 lakh is not nearly enough in order to build their houses. In some cases they have bought land in Muslim-majority villages such as Loi and Dabedi Khurd, but they require additional money to build their homes. At Loi, some young men we spoke to said they would like to swap land with the government. They would like to stay on where the camp is, and the government can take over the land where they have come from. They also say that they cannot build their houses overnight. If they have bought land, it is not fair that they are immediately being asked to leave.

Another major technical issue prevails that compensation has been given to families of 15, 17, 21, and 25, where instead of identifying a household as those listed on a single ration card, a grandparent and their sons and their respective families have collectively been identified as one family. To illustrate this, an elder in Loi camp cited a figure of 273 cases where compensation has been given to households in Budhana block, adding that there were 650 ration cards for those 273 households based on their assessment. From what we could gather in Loi camp, people from the two main riot-affected blocks of Budhana and Kandla have so far taken the 5 lakh compensation.

In order to make any longterm attempt at return and reconciliation, another challenge remains. Many Muslim families from each of the villages have gotten dispersed. We heard of villages where there were as few as five Muslim families in a village, and they all fled into the surrounding sugarcane fields in different directions to escape the violence, now not knowing where the others are. In Barnawi, we came across one of the 10-11 families from Deepakheri village, Saharanpur, and 2-4 families from many more in Gali village, Baghpat.

Justice

The meaning of *insaaf* or justice is different for different people, in almost all cases being inextricably tied to people's rights. Justice for different survivors includes a dignified roof of their heads, compensation for the damage caused, education for their children, a source of livelihood, arrests of perpetrators, and being able to say the *azaan* or wear topis without receiving threats or admonitions. Before the riots, Jats and Muslims had relations that were friendly, despite a hierarchy that did exist due to the fact that Muslims were often employers of the Jats. They attended each other's social functions and their children played and studied together. In many cases, Jats in the villages assured the survivors that nothing would happen but stories that the perpetrators were those who were already known to the survivors are the norm. The survivors, utterly disbelieving, betrayed and shocked at the series of events, are fearful of reprisals.

Everyone we spoke to said that their utmost desire is for justice, but many people we spoke with were resigned to the idea that justice may never come. In any event, justice remains integral to the process of reparation and longterm reconciliation.

Men complained that in Kharad village, the Pradhan's son participated in the killing. A man from Lisarh spoke of Hari Kishen baba, the leader of the Ghapwala khap from Lisarh, who called a panchayat. He had gone to attend the meeting but then decided to come back home midway through it because he got uneasy about what was being discussed and feared for his life. On the next day, 06.09.13, an Ansari boy of the village was stabbed. He says that if the people of the village had wanted, nothing would have happened. Nobody in his family died and they managed to escape, running through the fields to reach Loi village. His house was completely destroyed, after looting it, it was burned down. He had been trying to save for his daughter's marriage, and all was lost. He says that nobody has been arrested so far. The Jats openly give threats, mocking them by saying that they next time they will not be able to escape alive. He fears going back to the village may not be possible. All he wishes is to have a shelter over his head and rebuild his life.

People said that most of violence was carried out by unemployed and otherwise idle youth who were easily mobilised for these riots. A number of false cases have been filed against those who have tried to take legal recourse in the aftermath of the riots. One elder said that for every four cases filed by the Muslims, 6-10 have been filed by the Jats in villages like Lakh and Lisarh. In many instances where attempts were made to file FIRs against the perpetrators, the police put very weak sections on the FIR and there were no arrests. A number of Jat witnesses have apparently turned hostile under pressure from perpetrators.¹⁸

Those we spoke with said unanimously that those who carried out the killings were Jats, but that Dalits assisted in some cases due to the force of the dominant Jats, looting or spilling petrol for the Jats who lit fires and committed arson. Everyone spoke equally unanimously of how the Dalits participated due only to pressure from Jats who have them a narrative

¹⁸ We heard very few instances of police help or protection during the riots themselves, as the force is heavily dominated by Jats. In Joula camp, however, much admiration and respect was expressed for the circle officer of Budhana, Shailendra Lal, who did his job by rescuing 400 Muslims trying to flee the violence with the help of four BSF jawans.

that they will be protected by them as they are all Hindu, but who will likely later put their names forward if they get in trouble.



CONCLUSION

In the camps, the issue remains one of grossly inadequate resources or care being provided for displaced persons. It can also not be denied that people are being denied access to resources that should be theirs by the camp organisers who are misusing and co-opting relief that is not meant for them. Anyone we spoke to said that direct relief to them is best and most useful. The aftermath of the riots displays a situation of State inaction, apathy and discrimination against those who are affected. There has also been a deliberate polarisation of communities based on events and their incorrect framing and interpretation by vested interests, something that must be countered. Stock must be taken of how to ensure proper relief in the short term, along with adequate reparation, rehabilitation (with respect to both homes and livelihoods), justice, reconciliation and finally, resettlement, only in the event that rehabilitation to home villages is not possible.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Any work that is carried out must prioritise the needs of the most vulnerable amongst those who have been affected – including children, women, the elderly, the disabled, and youth.

Recommendations to the State include the following:

1. The State must officially recognise all the camps that are functioning, in order to adequately provide for the rights of affected persons and ensure that there is no prolonged suffering due to negligence.
2. More accurate assessments of numbers of displaced person must be collected, including those who are seeking shelter inside the homes of people from other villages. Assessments must be conducted to understand how all villages have been affected from where people have fled.
3. All forced evictions from relief camps must be prevented as most people have nowhere to go.
4. Surveys across camps should be conducted, in order to ensure that the needs of pregnant and lactating mothers, the disabled, the elderly, children and those who are in need of medical attention are not left out.
5. In the camps, the following should be ensured:
 - 5.1 Adequate shelter in the form of weather proof tents or relocation into *pucca* housing must be ensured.
 - 5.2 Community run *anganwadis* serving hot-cooked food, childcare shelters, mobile health clinics, on-site doctors. Children between 6 months to 6 years are entitled to age appropriate nutritional meals at *anganwadis* under the National Food Security Act, 2013.
 - 5.3 Maternal health awareness, hot-cooked food for pregnant and lactating mothers at *anganwadis*; female doctors; sensitising men about women's health, working with groups of adolescent girls on sanitation and hygiene.
 - 5.4 Maternity entitlements (of Rs. 6000 per month for six months) under India's Food Security Act should be made available to pregnant and lactating women at the camps. Under the same Act, the women are also entitled to nutritious meals at the *anganwadi* centres six months before and after the pregnancy.
 - 5.5 Stress, trauma, depression, nightmares and psychological disorders are common experiences after a conflict of such nature. Long-term psychosocial care and counselling for survivors should be provisioned (including for children).
 - 5.6 Special old-age pension cards, disability pension cards and widow pension cards should be rolled out.
 - 5.7 An adult literacy programme for women should be initiated.
 - 5.8 The Disaster Management Act, 2005 includes 'Internally Displaced Persons' or IDPs in its ambit. Since riot-affected survivors in camps come under this category, disaster relief under the Act should apply to this situation.
 - 5.9 The State governments should establish community kitchens and destitute feeding centres to offer free meals at the camps with dignity.
 - 5.10 The National Advisory Council's 2011 Draft on food security bill recommended special ration cards under the Public Distribution System for disaster-affected individuals

and the government must issue a similar order to meet the basic food security needs of the community.

- 5.11 The Central and state government, through relevant departments, ministries and civil society partners, should provision need and skill based employment, assistance, material aid to riot-affected men and women at the earliest.
 - 5.12 Security arrangements should be made at their home-village and survivors should be assisted in rescuing/securing items (if not burnt and looted) they left behind which may be of use.
 - 5.13 Schools in neighbouring villages should provide age-appropriate admission to children and adolescents and ensure extra-classes for these children to bring them up to speed with the course.
 - 5.14 State-government should partner with civil society organisations to establish on-camp educational facilities (books, notebooks, stationery, bags etc.). Remedial classes should also be organised for children taking their board examinations and they should be facilitated in getting their hall tickets in order to write their exams.
 - 5.15 Central/State government should provide transport for camps where children have to travel long distances to reach school.
 - 5.16 Awareness and advocacy drives around education for the girl child and against early marriage of girls. Engaging religious leaders on the same.
 - 5.17 Encouraging parents to follow-up on the whereabouts of their daughters.
 - 5.18 State-sponsored education and vocational training for adolescent girls.
 - 5.19 Tools should be provided to those who have lost their possessions so they are able to continue earning a living from their respective professions.
6. State should make provision for emergency cash for work to provide for the loss of livelihoods suffered by people living in camps.
 7. Legal aid must be provided to assist people in filing FIRs and following up legal cases. People should also be helped in securing compensation.
 8. On a related note, identification documents that include voter ID cards must be processed in order to also allow people to be able to access government welfare schemes as well as exercise their voting rights.
 9. Clear and transparent guidelines on compensation for loss of property are required. No clarity exists on what the criteria are in deciding eligibility of beneficiaries.
 10. Efforts by the district administration for long-term reconciliation by facilitating meetings between leaders of the Jat and Muslim community must be restarted and continued.
 11. Sustained effort is needed to create a secure environment, the absence of which is compelling people to not go back.
 12. Timely arrests of the accused named in FIRs must be ensured irrespective of the community or social standing of the accused. This is imperative in order to create an environment of greater security and to prevent further outbreak of hostilities.
 13. Accountability of local public institutions such as local government hospitals must be demanded.

Recommendations to Humanitarian Organisations

Based on recommendations for the government outlined in the section above, humanitarian organisations must work to support interventions in multiple areas, as also put continuous pressure on the government to fulfil its responsibilities. For NGOs and members of civil society with secular goals, the humanitarian relief work must be undertaken through a thorough process, where the issue is looked upon as every community or individual's concern. Longterm work should ideally be undertaken by groups comprising members of both affected communities as well as Dalits. Any intervention must ensure that it is not reinforcing prevailing hierarchies in society – whether based on gender, religion, caste, class or disability.

1) Food Aid

Particularly in the camps in Shamli district, there is an acute shortage of food. People are surviving on food being provided by religious charities and/or individuals which is on very small scale. It is estimated that people will need food support for at least the next two months before they begin to restore their livelihood. Households are buying food on credit from the local grocery store or taking credit from host villages. Also, there is a need to address the nutrition needs of children, pregnant women and lactating women. *Organisations must therefore provide necessary emergency food aid if there is in an absence of the same from the government, keeping in mind the health of infants, children and pregnant and lactating women.*

2) Livelihood Support

Most of the affected community members are daily wage labourers and come from the unorganised sector. A detailed livelihood assessment is required to understand the support required by various people including artisans and hawkers. Occupational groups like masons, barbers, carpenters, ironsmiths, cobblers, etc. have lost all their tools and equipment. *An initiation of cash for work programs is therefore required. Livelihood support programs through support for toolkits and small investment support is also needed.*

3) Non Food Items (NFI), Warm clothes & bedding, and Solar Lamps

Since the communities have lost all the household assets including utensils, there is a need for the same. With the onset of winter warm clothes and bedding are also required in some neglected camps. *Support for NFI's which include kitchen sets, bathroom sets, hygiene kits (including sanitary tissues) is needed. Also, solar lamps are required as most of the camps do not have regular power supply.*

4) Health Camps

There is a high prevalence of various diseases especially amongst young children including pneumonia, jaundice, common flu, and throat infections. Also, there are a number of lactating and pregnant women in the camps. *Therefore, there is a need to organise regular*

health camps with qualified doctors, including female doctors and paediatricians. Emphasis on counselling on maternal health for pregnant and lactating women is also required.

5) Shelter

A majority of the people living in camps do not have appropriate and adequate shelter. Many families have created tents out of plastic sheets and old cloth. *Temporary shelter support, weather-proof in nature is required, until the time that people are able to be rehabilitated.*

6) Education

A large number of riot-affected children and youth have been displaced and excluded from school or college education. Many of them studied in mixed groups with children of Jats as their closest friends. Their books, notes, exam hall tickets and bags have been left behind, probably even burnt. A few camps have set up makeshift madrasas and modest primary teaching facilities, however, these are greatly inadequate and many other camps have no such facilities. Since the madrasas stop short of teaching a range of subjects except Urdu and in some cases, Hindi, a thoughtful approach to education, play activities and learning for children is required. Schools in neighbouring villages should provide age-appropriate admission to children and adolescents and ensure extra-classes for these children to bring them up to speed with the course. *There is a need to setup educational facilities like tuition and coaching classes so that children education can continue. Education material like bags, uniforms, notebooks and other stationary should also be provided to these children.*

7) WASH

Most people had built makeshift toilets by digging small pits just outside their tents which were overflowing with sewage and were blocked. Mobile toilets also choke easily and require the removal of sewage, which if dumped at the campsite can pose a further health hazard. In many camps, the number of water points was inadequate. Hand pumps installed at camps for drinking water were next to over-flowing sewage from toilets, which could contaminate water sources in long run. There is a need for distribution of portable water-purifiers or filters to prevent outbreak of water-borne diseases. Further, waste disposal systems are not in place. *Therefore, camps committees must be supported in creating a waste disposal system including solid waste management. Gender appropriate toilets and bathing cubicles need to be built on an urgent basis, keeping in mind privacy and security for women. And hand pumps and water purification systems are required for providing safe and clean drinking water.*

8) Psycho-Social Counselling

The impact of a conflict can be very deep and in the immediate aftermath, trauma is difficult to overcome. There are many women who have faced sexual violence. *There is an urgent need to provide psycho-social counselling to the people who have been displaced.*

ANNEXURE I: DETAILS OF CAMPS VISITED

Table 1.1 Basic Data on Camps

S. No.	Location (Village, Block, District)	Name of camp	Number of families ¹⁹	Number of survivors	Organisations providing relief	Type of land	Location camp residents have come from	Deaths in the camps	Assistance from the government	Closure of camp
1	Loi village, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district	Loi camp	523	3500 (including 350 children)	Jamaat-e-Islami, NDTV (blanket drive), ANHAD (providing Rs. 25000 to certain families) etc.	Govt. land lying vacant	Largely from Budhana block itself ²⁰	17 (including 11 children)	Rations, most recently since 18.12.2013, govt. doctors also come to the camp and a govt. anganwadi has been set up. At the time of our visit, Budhana SDM came last on 07.12.2013.	When we visited the camp on 23.12.13, there were already rumblings that the administration was asking them to leave.
2	Jogia Khera village, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district	Jogia Khera camp	137 families settled into homes in the village	-	Material and legal support through families in the village; religious charities	Private land	Largely from Budhana block, many from Phugana village		Initially, some rations, but assistance stopped after the first two months	
3	Joula village, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district	Joula aka Bijlighar camp	-	3000		Govt. land	Lisarh, other violence-affected villages in Budhana			Over 80 families appear to have been

¹⁹Data estimates include information from Mr. Kanwal Singh, field officer with Astitva, and our own inquiries at the camp.

²⁰ Villages include Phugana, Kharad, Lakh, Lisarh, Hassanpur, Bawadi, Hadoli, Kabrot, Simbhalka, Kakhre, Kutba, Kutbi, Karonde and Mohammanpur-Rai Singh.

							block			moved to housing quarters of the government, with two families sharing one room
4	Dabedi Khurd village, Kairana block, Shamli district	Dabedi Khurd camp	50-75 ²¹	-	Oxfam (hygiene kits)	Land owned by the panchayat as well as some locals ²²	Muzaffarnagar, Shamli, and Baghpat ²³	6 children (4 male; 2 female), 1 elderly man in his late 60s	35 blankets for 75 families	
5	Saneti village, Kairana block, Shamli district	Saneti – I (aka Akbarpur Saneti Madrasa camp)	90-95	157 children below the age of 14		Forest dept. govt. land	12-16 villages in Muzaffarnagar ²⁴ , Shamli and Baghpat districts	6 children (details in Annexure 3)	No one from the ruling party and no district officials have visited	Threat of eviction
6	Saneti village, Kairana block, Shamli district	Saneti (Pathed road)	83	-	Religious charities including from Deoband and Patna, and Jamaat-e-Islami	Forest dept. govt. land	Muzaffarnagar, Shamli and Baghpat districts ²⁵	2 children		Threat of eviction
7	Barnawi village,	Barnawi –	280	1400	Religious charities		Kishanpur,			

²¹ We were told that while there were over 70 families present in the camp, a number of them have left to go to work at brick kilns, taking their families with them.

²² Each family has been given a small plot on which to set up tent or make mud house. Conflicting reports that the land is forest department land.

²³ A near-comprehensive list of villages includes: Dubhar (30 families, many of whom had concrete houses), Khera Mastan (3), Soram (2), Bhora Khurd (3), Kande/Kandle (1), Tawi (1), Gandoli, Hewe, Naley, Nara, Karawe, Kadi-Bawri, Kakre (many of whom have left and shifted in with their relatives), Jaggari and Tugana

²⁴ Including families from Kutbi village, Budhana block, where violence took place

²⁵ Including families from Budhana block and villages including Bilal, Dhari, Muzzafarpur, Mukundpur, Navada, Babri, Mandvara, Khajju, Mumbai Khedhi, Bhadoi, Dinkarpur, Chaua Majra, Pidaura and Badka.

	Kairana block, Shamli district	2 (north)	(counted the day of the visit by the patwari) ²⁶		including from Deoband and Patna; Oxfam India		Bhorkala, Haiwa and Mukanpur (Muzaffarnagar) ; no one in this camp is yet entitled to compensation			
8	Barnawi village, Kairana block, Shamli district	Barnawi – 2 (south)	102-121		Tableeghi Jamaat		Muzaffarnagar ²⁷ , Shamli, Baghpat ²⁸ and Saharanpur Districts	2 children – one 6 days old; another 6 years old	35 blankets for over 100 families ²⁹	
9	Malakpura village, Kairana block, Shamli district	Malakpur-I	1100	2500 children	Tayyab Trust (Deoband); Popular Front (Kerala)	Forest dept. govt. land	Many survivors of physical and sexual violence		20 quintals of firewood at the end of December	The DM has recently agreed not to shut down this camp due to a number of protests ³⁰ . The government had some weeks ago filed cases against the organisers of the camp for cutting down shrubs on

²⁶ The number increased as many who had gone to stay with relatives have returned since their relatives cannot sustain them indefinitely.

²⁷ 7-8 families from Bhorkala village, some from Kakra village

²⁸ One family from Nirpada village

²⁹ One woman said, “The government just wanted to create chaos and make us fight with one another by bringing 35 blankets for over 100 families. There was no dignity in the way they were distributed. Additionally, we had to give our thumbprint or sign for it, and have our picture taken.”

³⁰ As learned in a phone conversation with a field worker from Astitva on 06.01.2014. Those in the camps claimed that govt. has not acted against individuals who have previously appropriated govt. land in the area, and that they must allow them to stay because of the current circumstances.

										Forest Dept. land on which this camp has been put up.
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

Source: Interactions with people in the camps, camp committee members, village pradhans where applicable, NGO workers and local volunteers

Table 1.2 Humanitarian Assessment Data

S. No.	Camp	Health	Clean Water + Sanitation	Food rations/nutrition	Shelter	Previous Livelihood	Education	Other Details
1	Loi	Govt. doctors that arrived four days prior are at the camp from 12-4 pm. For emergency facilities, the ambulance has to be called dialling 108. Some complained that the doctors give the same medication for every ailment.	Stagnating cesspools of water, sewage, garbage; 20 toilets but no longer useable as built by digging pits in the ground and erecting bamboo-tarpaulin structure above (which have filled up and are unusable); use of bleach powder on the ground; some urinating and defecating right next to their tents	4 kg wheat, 400 gm pulses, 400 gm sugar, 5 kg rice and 1 kg salt issued for 10-15 days for a family of four as observed on a ration card made by the camp committee.	Most families were surviving in tarpaulin tents, some layered additionally with pieces of cloth ³¹ .	Hawkers, agricultural labourers	Astitva, a local NGO has begun teaching the children in a makeshift school in the camp. The children are also given books and clothes.	One light bulb per tent with electricity connection
2	Jogia Khera	Private village doctor		Rations were usually through donations/ <i>Ibadat</i> at the madrassa. Now, in some cases, families in the village feed the displaced persons, but the majority are	Families living with villagers in spare rooms in their homes	Hawkers, barbers, carpenters	Children who had their board exams this year have missed them as they have had to drop out, and many youth do not have their	Expressed fear of invisibilisation in the eyes of the government as they are living inside the village

³¹ None of the tents in any of the camps we went to were weather or water proof.

				performing daily wage tasks to earn a living as they are expected to buy their own rations.			school certificates with them.	
3	Joula	No medical services – they go to the doctor in Joula village or to the block hospital in Budhana	No toilet facilities; use of bleach powder; two hand pumps, but surrounded by filth; going to the toilet in the fields is now more difficult as crop has been harvested	Definite shortage of food, with most people having one full meal a day, usually of rice or roti cooked with salt	Lack of sufficient bedding, tentage. Tents much smaller than those in Loi	Hawkers	Both a madrasa and a govt. school in the village; children primarily being sent to the madrasa	
4	Dabedi Khurd	One doctor has begun coming a few days prior from the block hospital in Kairana, coming every alternate day	Cesspool at the entrance of the camp; construction of a few pucca toilets has begun by a private organisation; makeshift pits with bamboo and tarpaulin covering currently being used as toilets		Tents more spread out, a few newly built brick and mud structures; reports that some have bought plots of 200 sq. ft. from the private owner of the land from the village after receiving their compensation	Artisans, hawkers, agricultural labourers, brick kiln workers, some small farmers	Madrasa on the main road as well as school in the village that some people have gotten their children registered at	A makeshift mosque has been constructed at the entrance to the camp
5	Suneti – 1 (aka Akbarpur Saneti Madrasa camp)	Mobile medical vans began coming two days prior to our visit; no medical aid prior to that; midwife from the camp itself has assisted in giving	1 handpump fixed by an organisation from Hyderabad, but with sewage flowing around it		Tents as in other camps, along with a few canvas tents		There is a madrasa that is providing education to 150 people, which runs up till class V	

		birth to four babies, all of which survived ³²						
6	Suneti (Pathed Road)	Govt. doctor's began one day prior, but no one was present the day of our visit; a number of women have suffered miscarriages due to the hard labour	Sewage across the open areas of the camp	Complete lack of steady ration, with most families surviving on tea and one meal of salt and rice per day	Not everyone had even the most basic tents; a few people were trying to build mud and thatch houses		No school or madrasa that the children can go to	
7	Barnawi II – North	No medical assistance; a young man from the camp who has studied medicine is helping to treat people; Anganwadi being run by the government, initially set up by Jamaat-e-Islami	Many needs, major neglect; open defecation in many parts of the camp	Anganwadi being run by the pradhan	Largely similar tents but some have dug up mud from the area around the camp and have built or are building mud houses		About 200 children are attending the local madrasa in the camp, but many are reluctant to send their children there as they prefer for them to have a more holistic education	
8	Barnawi II – South	No medical assistance until one week prior to our visit		Food rations scarce	Some mud+brick constructions, most others have bare tents. Not enough shelter material or bedding for those in tents	Carpenters, tailors, masons, agricultural labour, hawkers		A make-shift mosque has been constructed along with a water tank and a place to perform ablutions
9	Malakpur	Many deaths due to		Anganwadi that is		Agricultural	School 1.5 km	

³² Two babies were given birth to in the Kairana government hospital. They died five and eight days later, respectively.

		pneumonia		run by Jamaat-e-Islami		labourers, hawkers	away, many too small to travel	
--	--	-----------	--	------------------------	--	--------------------	--------------------------------	--

Source: Interactions with people in the camps, camp committee members, village pradhans where applicable, NGO workers and local volunteers

Additionally, in Muzaffarnagar district, there are three camps in Shahpur block – Shahpur 1, 2 and 3 (Shahpur block). The three camps together have a total of 600 families living there. In Harsauli camp (Baghra block), there are approximately 175 families. In Khartaula camp (Khartauli block), there are about 55 families. Harsauli and Khartaula are the most neglected camps in Muzaffarnagar district.

In Shamli district, there are two camps in Malakpur – Malakpur Camp no 1 which has around 1100 families living there, and Malakpur Camp no. 2, comprising a total of 325 families. There is also one camp in Pachet and another known as Murga Farm, both in Kairana block. A third camp in Barnawi known as Barnawi – I has 93 families. There are also camps in Kandhla block, Shamli district and in Loni, Ghaziabad district.

Thus the total number of camps appears to be above 20, but this figure is likely to keep changing in the days and weeks ahead. As mentioned before, less than a handful of these are recognised by the government.

Location 1: Loi camp, Budhana Block, Muzaffarnagar district

Type of camp: Unofficial camp/host village, but initially recognised by the government. In late December, the first camp in Muzaffarnagar which was evacuated by government officials by raising the tents, after which some families have shifted to Neem Kheri bus stand, others have been forced to look for space in other camps or relatives.

The road to Loi cuts off from the main Budhana road and is located about 3-4 kilometres away from there. The road can only accommodate one-sided traffic at any given point of time and runs parallel to a small local water canal before you turn left and reach the camp. The camp was set up on the morning of 08.09.2013. 10,000 people had first collected in Loi camp, but that number came down significantly once people started moving into their relatives' homes or in some cases, returning to their villages. People from Loi village are overseeing the relief in the camp. It is a Muslim-majority village.

Location 2: Jogia Khera settlement, Budhana Block, Muzaffarnagar district

Type of camp: Host village

In Jogia Khera, the camp was initially running out of Madrasa Islamia – a nearby Madrasa. That was shut down a few weeks prior to our visit, due to the harsh cold and poor availability of shelter and sanitation needs. In order to provide for the families staying in that shelter, the pradhan of the village, which is 100 percent Muslim, encouraged the households of the village to take in families into their own homes. 137 displaced families were thereby accommodated³³.

Location 3: Joula camp, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district

Type of camp: Unofficial camp/host village

Joula camp is 37 km from Muzaffarnagar town. It is located off the Kandla-Budhana road inside a gated power substation, enclosed within boundary walls³⁴. Adjacent to the camp is a road leading to Joula village, a Muslim-majority village where many landed Muslims including Mulle Jats such as Ranas reside. The camp committee includes a Zila Parishad member who is from Joula village.

Location 4: Dabedi Khurd, Kairana block, Shamli district

Type of camp: Unofficial camp/host village

Daberi Khurd is in the interiors of Shamli district and is at a further 20 kilometres from the Malakpur camp. The camp was started on 11.09.2013. Initially, people who fled stayed in the homes of people in the nearby village. The tents came up after September once the

³³ Displaced families we spoke with said that they have been taken into homes and shown immense dignity and affection in the manner in which they are being taken care of. Shahid, a 50 year old man, expressed his gratitude towards the pradhan and the host family with which the members of his own family have been temporarily resettled with, the amount of affection and cooperation offered by them, can't really be paid off in any way. His face, however, expressed a degree of helplessness when he said, "*hum shukraguzaar hai, haamare liye yahan ke logo ne itna kiya, ye ehsaan kabhi nahi chuka paayenge*" (we are grateful, these people have done so much for us, we will never be able to repay this favour).

³⁴ The power supply at Jola is, however, erratic, making it extremely difficult to see at night, with fire from *chuhlas* as the only source of dim light.

grounds were cleared. All the camps in Shamli that we visited are located in areas which are part-jungle, therefore prone to poisonous snakes and scorpions.

Location 5: Saneti – I (aka Akbarpur Saneti Madrasa Camp), Kairana block, Shamli district

Type of camp: Unofficial camp

This is one of the three camps in Saneti. It is opposite the local Madarsa. The camp is adjacent to the road that comes from Malakpur. Fields surround the camp on three sides. There is a steep incline separating the camp from the road. During the monsoon, the entire camp was filled with water.

Location 6: Saneti (Pathed Road), Kairana block, Shamli district

Type of camp: Unofficial camp

The camp is located on both sides of the road, and the shelters are surrounded by shrubbery on all sides.

Location 7: Barnawi-II camp (North), Kairana block, Shamli district

Type of camp: Unofficial camp/host village

This camp is about a kilometre away from the Yamuna river, and therefore bears the brunt of the harsh cold. The pradhan of the village is overseeing the workings of the camp committee.

Location 8: Barnawi-II camp (South), Kairana block, Shamli district

Type of camp: Unofficial Camp

The camp is unprotected and open on all sides, which implies that the camp is extremely vulnerable in the face of harsh cold winds. The camp suffers relative neglect because no one from the village itself is coordinating relief efforts there.

ANNEXURE 2: CASE STUDIES

2.1 Ruksana: Kharad village, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district (Age - 25 years); Loi camp

Ruksana was nine months pregnant when the rioters approached her village on 8 September. Her husband took her in his arms and they ran from the village with the riot mob charging at them from behind. “We never dreamt of something so horrific. We did not even wind up our kitchen. We just ran.” Not hopeful that her child would survive, she gave birth to a baby girl, Sara, after coming to the camp (12 September). So that her four months old daughter survives the biting winter chill, Ruksana forgoes her sleep, sits up all night and shelters Sara under her shawl, close to her mother’s chest and its warmth. ‘We haven’t slept for days together. Who can sleep in such times?’ Ruksana and her husband, Faheem’s tent is dark, without any belongings, with only a blanket covering one half of the ground and a polyester sack covering a third quarter, leaving a significant portion of the ground exposed. The rain from a few days ago, Ruksana describes, caused great distress to all. ‘The water came rushing in, soiled our *jhuggis* and left out blankets wet. There was no place to sit. I held my daughter in my arms and remained standing all day. It was so cold.’ The trouble only doubled with the rainwater seeping in through the poor quality tarpaulin. That day most families were unable to cook as their mud *chuhlas* were damp. ‘We made our children sleep hungry,’ said a chorus of women who had gathered at Ruksana’s tent. Most of them describe a dire lack of drinking water, healthcare (they are given the same medicines for cold, cough, swelling, motions) and sanitation. Ruksana narrates that the last time she bathed was eight days ago.

Ruksana developed complications during her delivery, became septic, had high blood pressure; the money Faheem (formerly, a welder) had has been spent on securing better health for her. ‘We are penniless today and cannot even give Rs. 1 to our children,’ says Ruksana, and adds that the shift from living in their own house to living in the camp, where they have to beg for the very basic necessities of life, is a humiliating experience that violates their dignity. With Sara barely a month old, Ruksana experienced a period of severe depression and psychological stress, a state that compelled her husband and mother-in-law to send her to her brother in Bijnor. ‘After coming to the camp, I had nightmares about the riots. I could not think of anything else but that. I did not think my daughter would survive. I used to cry a lot. So they sent me to my brother’s.’ Hoping that the sun would shine more often, she still finds nightfall fearsome and prefers daytime.

‘*Sab jhoothe ashwasan dete hai, karta koyi kuchh nahin* (People make promises but none fulfils them)’, remarks Ruksana, upset that the leaders from the State and Centre have not visited to inquire after her and others like her in the camp. ‘People from Loi camp sat on the main road all day eagerly waiting for Rahul Gandhi. We thought we would tell him about our plight and he would bring us some relief. Akhilesh Yadav too has not come.’ She proceeded to suggest that help in camp is needed immediately and not after several months have passed. Her rationale is that they may not be starving but for how long will they depend on external aid? ‘Are we going to live here forever? Will our kids survive the hardship?’ she asks. ‘We have lost everything and the say nothing happened in Kharad. How can they see someone die? Where is their humanity? There is no chance of going back. Should we return to get our children killed? Our people, mosque and Quran- all were murdered. We never dreamt this would happen,’ Ruksana

declared her intention never to return, while remembering the togetherness with which they lived before the riots. *Insaaf* for her is a house of her own and a future for her children.

Before her marriage to Faheem, Ruksana was a primary schoolteacher, who has seven years of teaching experience. She taught all subjects. 'I don't want our kids to be illiterate,' says Ruksana, who teaches children at the temporary primary school in Loi camp. 'Today, I taught them names of birds and days of a week,' she says, and smiles for the first time.

2.2 Mahtab and Fiza: Phugana village, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district; Loi Camp

Peeping from the corner of the tent was a woman with an infant on her lap; her eyes piercing. Fiza ran with her husband Mahtab from Phugana to find refuge in the camps established in Muzaffarnagar district, and when they happened to reach Loi, the two parted as they ran to save their lives from mobs that were still trailing them, and finally met again at Loi. Fiza says the happiness having seen her husband alive was immense. She was pregnant, then, and the journey from Phugana to Loi was painful. The plight was distressing, having not a single minute to identify and pick items that they would need. They had immense trust and faith in their village pradhan, who was from the Jat community and mentioned that they ran to him for help. But they said that he turned out to be a *shaitans*. People were burnt alive, killed violently, the mosque and their houses were lit on fire, open looting took place for even of the tiniest of items possible. They called themselves "*nihathe log*," who ran to save their lives wherever the road took them, thanking the sugarcane harvest a great deal as it saved them from the attackers.

Having asked if they'd chose to go back to their own home, if the government were to work toward such an initiative, or if both the communities plan to compromise and welcome each other mutually, the couple replied in distress, "*Jahan masjid me aag laga di, vahan jaake batao kaise reh sakte hain*" (where people have set fire to the mosque, go there and tell us how we can stay there). They also revealed the remarks being made by the Jats of their village, "*Kisi musalmaan ko is gaanv me ghusne nahi denge*" (we will not let any Muslims enter this village). Some members of the Jat community had even said that they would bring physical impairment by cutting their limbs badly such that they do not forget this in their lifetime, also to leave them impaired to do any sort of work in the years ahead.

The couple mentioned the distress that they had suffered because of this unnecessary mass killing which has further contributed to their poverty, from which they arose by working hard to provide enough for the family. Mahtab said, "*Jiske ghar me aag lage, bas usey hi pata chale ye dard, hum to ye dua karen ki kisi dushman ke ghar bhi aisa na ho*" (only those who have had fire set to their houses can understand the pain, we would never hope for this to happen to our enemies).

As far as the relationship between the two communities: Muslims and Hindus, particularly *Jats* are concerned, the couple expressed a distant but previously harmonious relationship. The relationships with other Hindu communities like Harijans, Chamars, Jhimmirs, Jogis and Kashyaps were cooperative and harmonious too. Muslims from their village often used to be the helping hands in marriages and funerals, shared happiness and sadness together, took care

of each other families in times of need, dined together, this, however came as a surprise to majority of them that people who were once friendly can turn enemies in no time, so brutal that they ran to cut people apart, kill them brutally, embarrass women by taking off their clothes, leaving them naked, raping their bodies, tearing them apart, stabbing their genitals, cutting breasts, and pasting them on the wall labelling as *musalmanis*. It was also revealed that it was members of the Jat community who did the killing whereas the other Hindu communities were employed to play a helping role to facilitate the same, and loot houses, mosques, and small shops.

Mahtab and Fiza that they used to donate and give alms to the poor, and now they are alive on the alms given by upper classes sitting miles away, looking at them on their television screens, feeling bad at their plight. Their helplessness to the situation was quite apparent as they started to label themselves as *nihathe*, *bechaare*, and *gareeb*. As they said, “*pehle hum daan karte the, ab daan ka kha rahe hai, toota foota istemaal kar rahe hai, aap sab ka diya hua fata puraana pehan rahe hain, ye ehsaan to teen peedhi tak nahi utaar payenge* (earlier we used to give, now we are eating that which has been donated, we are using broken goods, we are wearing people’s old torn clothes, we won’t be able to turn this in three generations).”

A few others in the vicinity reported that the relationships with Jats were bad even before and it has worsened after this pogrom, as one man pointed out “*pehle ke sambandh bhi ache nahi the, itna paisa hai to akkad hai* (relations were not very good even earlier, when there is wealth, there is arrogance)”. Other women in the camps at Barnawi said something quite similar to this “*Laathi, talwaar to pehle bhi both uthaaye hai inhone, maara bhi hua hai* (they picked up weapons a lot in the past, and they’ve also hit us before)”.

Women expressed fear on the name of going back. A woman from Barnawi mentioned that she along with her husband tried going back to pick up some household items, on the border came the sounds of some men, “*Vo jaati hui musalmaani dikh rahi hai, loot lo, kaat lo* (that woman who is walking looks Muslim, steal from her, cut her up)”. On hearing this, she ran with great speed back to the camp to save herself and her honor. She said that would prefer poisoning herself than being used violently by the men.

2.3 Afsana: Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district; Saneti Camp (Pathed Road)

As a six year old boy shouted, “*didi idhar aao*”, my footsteps just couldn’t stop to reach him. He offered me to see his mud house and how well they had managed to make the items with mud; I expressed my amazement at their creativity. While I was engrossed talking to this young boy Sameer, a woman approached from the back, in anger, and asked if I was a Hindu. I was dumbstruck to what to answer. I never wanted to say *yes* and not even *no*. It was this moment wherein I really had to think if I belong to a particular religion called Hindu, this question never used to strike heart, this hard, as it did, when Afsana posed it. I, in utter haste, however, requested her to consider me a friend who had come to listen to them, she nodded, and seems to have accepted.

She looked at me with her glaring eyes, for about few minutes as I engaged myself to talk to other women around the tent. While I was engrossed in the conversation, Afsana, the woman who was initially very angry, somehow appeared calm, and offered me a seat in her mud house. She expressed in great

detail the state of women when Jat men ran to attack them, revealing a lot more about the situations and current problems in need of peaceful solutions. She expressed anger with the fact that women were treated, abused and rejected and revealed that a majority had poisoned themselves to death so that they were not assaulted by the Jat men. She said that they somehow managed to run from Budhance to reach Sardana, but later increasing rumours of riot there, forced them to leave the rented space that they had found after a long search, to leave for the camps where other displaced persons are seeking refuge. She was agitated on the question of being asked to go back home, as she said, "*vahan kya apni izzat lutvaane jayen*" (should we go back to restore our honour). To this, another woman said, "*ab to aisa hai ki aadmi ko dekh ke aadmi darr jaye*" (now it is such that just looking at a man can scare a person).

Afsana also expressed her anger towards the government saying that they had enough power to quell these communal riots, but instead they allowed them to grow. She said they voted and received nothing, stating "*unke bas me kya nahi hai*" (they could have done so much). Another *ehsaan* (favour) that she wanted from the government was land and a small house with a lock and key where she along with her family members can live without fear. People in the relief camps revealed that they have been asked several times to vacate the land.

Afsana is in the early trimester of her pregnancy, and said that the bleeding took place for four (4) days consecutively, which stopped abruptly, and started again after about ten (10) days. On being asked about the check-up with the doctors in the camp, she said, "*doctor keh re hain bacha gira do, humse nahi hoga, ab batao kahan se bacha girayen, bacha giraane ke liye bhi to paisa chahiye, paisa kahan se laayen*" (the doctor has asked me to terminate the child, saying they cannot manage, but I need money for that as well, and where do I get it from). Pregnant and lactating mothers, being vulnerable, and more prone to infections, are required to eat well, here, but here in the camps, these women are often the last to get a meal. They are being ignored by the doctors as well. If nothing is done soon, such situations can prove fatal to the expectant mothers. The lactating and nursing mothers had said that they fail to secrete enough of breast milk to feed their young infants. They are clueless about what to do.

2.4 Maleeha: Phugana village, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar district (Age - 45 years); Jogia Khera village

Maleeha is a single mother of five. Her husband passed away 6 years ago, and 20 years ago, she lost her father. She relies on her late husband's parents for help when needed, and at the time that the riots broke out, they were staying with her in-laws. She worked for the past many years as an agricultural labourer, and as of four months ago, made a daily wage of 150 rupees per day. Five men whose fields she had worked on for many years, attacked and raped her the morning the riots broke out. She was working alone at home at the time. She managed to run away through the sugarcane fields. Many people were killed in her village, and she is one of many women who says that the worst violence in these incidents was faced by women. The police came only 10-15 days after the incidents. Many people tried calling the police the day the violence broke out, but to no avail, as no one answered the telephone. She says that in the case of their village, the pradhan himself asked people to kill Muslims. She says that members of the Chamar community also participated in the looting, but not due to their own accord, but instead, because they were forced to by the Jats, who have a very strong hold over them.

Maleeha feels safe here, and is well cared for in the home where she stays. When she was taken to the hospital for a medical check-up, she was told by the doctor that she was lying and that nothing had happened to her. Despite this, with a family friend's help, she received assistance in filing an FIR against her attackers.

2.5 Shamshad, Tugana village, Baghpat district

Shamshad used to work as a hawker, selling clothes all over north India in different locations. The distance to his village from this camp is between 30 and 40 kilometres. Before coming to this village, they were staying in Kandla relief camp. In their village, they had 300 gaj of land, three houses (including those of his children) and a *neem* tree. They came on September 9 to Dabedi Khurd.

He feels safe in this village because it is dominated by Muslims and now he can leave his family in the village and look for means of earning a livelihood. His family had good relations with members of the Jat community in the past. When asked why has he left the village, he replied, "*dahshat*," i.e. fear. '*Duniya chahiye kuch bhi kah de, hume pata hai kitni dahshat hai*' (Whatever the world says, we know how much fear there is). When he went back to his village two months ago, Jats he knew scolded him and asked him to leave. He said there is no respect for his people in the village any longer. He added that while no one died in his village, there were small incidents of violence and fights between the two communities. Some members of his community such as the lohars or ironsmiths who had stronger relations with the Jats are still there.

2.6 Sanawar, Sunne village, Budhana block, Muzaffarnagar (Age: 28 years)

Sunne village is located near Lisarh, which witnessed some of the worst violence during the riots. Sunawar has four children and lives with his parents in the village. He used to sell clothes as a hawker, and said he has traveled to many parts of the country for his work. His relatives from Kutbe called to inform him about the outbreak of riots, after which he fled the village. He added that in Lisarh, women were raped by both young and old men and set on fire. Some communities in his village such as Telis, Dhobis and Lohars have remained there because of the interdependency of work amongst both communities. Some Muslim zamindars have also continued to stay in their village.

Sunawar said that in the past, there had been small incidents which were causing discomfort amongst the Muslims in his village. In one incident, a few Jat men scolded his brother for losing a cricket match. Often, they were not respected by the Jats in the manner in which they were spoken to. After fleeing, he said that he and his family couldn't sleep for many days fearing an attack from the Jats. He says that they cannot think of returning as they would have to cross the villages of Jats on the way and could be attacked any time. He says that while he believes there are some families in his village who have helped them in the past, that can't be sustained for a longer period in the future because of the fear of boycott.

ANNEXURE 3: DETAILS OF CHILDREN WHO HAVE DIED IN SUNETI CAMP

1. Female child: Firdaus
Age: 5 days
Father: Mussalim; Mother: Ruksana (22 years)
Village: Bisrak
Occupation: Badhai/Carpentry
2. Male child: Umar
Age: 8 days
Father: Shamim; Mother: Mehrana (21 years)
Village: Bisrak
Occupation: Badhai/Carpentry
3. Female child: Firoze
Age: 1 month
Father: Taahir (Shaikh)
Village: Fuvana
4. Female child: Fatima
Age: 5 years
Father: Irfan (Shaikh)
Village: Sabka
5. Female child: Zoya
Age: 5 years
Father: Imran
Occupation: Lohar; Village: Kakor
6. Female child: Shahdeen
Age: 5 years
Father: Vakeel (Shaikh)
Village: Tugana
Occupation: Hawker